Ethics Course for Human Service Providers: Multicultural and Multidisciplinary Opportunities and Challenges

Rebecca Toporek, Ph.D.
San Francisco State University
rtoporek@sfsu.edu

January 14, 2009

Division 17 is approved by the American Psychological Association to sponsor continuing education for psychologists. Division 17 maintains responsibility for this program and its content.
Overview and Agenda

- Introductions
  - Presenters
  - Learning Objectives
  - Ground rules
- How has your work changed in the past two years?
  - Client population
  - Challenges to your scope of practice
  - Cross disciplinary work
- Multicultural Ethical Decision Making
  - A model
  - Applications
- Future Directions
Learning Objectives

At the end of this workshop, participants will be able to:

- Describe a model for multicultural ethical decision making
- Apply the model to multicultural and multidisciplinary issues
- Identify strategies for recognizing and addressing ethical and relational conflicts when they arise
Ground Rules

- Basic ethical considerations:
  - Confidentiality
  - Respect
  - Collegiality
  - Other?

- Safety
  - What conditions would help make this a positive learning experience for you?
Introductions

- Presenter and Facilitators
- Disciplines represented
  - Ethical code most relevant to your work?
    - APA
    - NASW
    - ACA
    - Other?
Work Life

Consider the work you do now, compared to the work you did prior to 2006, how has it changed?

- Client population
- Challenges to your scope of practice
- Cross disciplinary work
Ethical Challenges

- What ethical challenges arise in your work currently in the areas of multicultural issues or interdisciplinary collaboration?
  - Who is involved?
  - What are the complexities of resolving those?
  - What aspects of culture may be reflected in the challenges?
Two Years After Katrina: A Survey of Mental Health and Addiction Providers in New Orleans and Baton Rouge, Louisiana

- Four out of five providers (86%) said their caseload had increased after Katrina.
- Most providers have experienced an increase in patients with specific disorders, including PTSD, depression and anxiety.
- Low pay and “burnout” were cited most frequently by professionals as reasons they might consider leaving the profession (respondents could give more than one reason).
- Inability to rebuild their homes was the main challenge respondents face that might make them leave the area.

National Council for Community Behavioral Healthcare – August 22, 2007
Survey assesses nonwork demands and resources with a specific focus on participants’ experiences during and after Hurricane Katrina

Inclusion of multicultural issues such as change in client population, self-perceived cultural competence, as well as cultural understanding of colleagues and supervisors

Thus far, 224 human service providers in the Greater New Orleans area have completed online survey
Preliminary Results

- Problems with managing both personal and work-related demands predicted burnout, turnover intentions, as well as both mental and physical wellbeing.
- Respect, a sense of control at work, and confidence in the employers’ commitment to core values predicted employees’ work engagement.
- Employees’ turnover intentions were a function of personal life stressors as well as work-related challenges, including value conflicts with their employer, poor relationships with colleagues and supervisors, and low levels of involvement in their work.
- Employees whose lives Hurricane Katrina disrupted continued to experience distress two years after the storm. Specifically, those who relocated to a hotel, a shelter, or outside of New Orleans reported greater exhaustion and lower mental wellbeing than did those who remained in their homes or found other local accommodation after the storm.
“Minority and low income Americans are also more likely to be underserved by government and private relief agencies before, during and after environmental calamities such as Katrina”

(Pastor, Bullard, Boyce, Fothergill, Morello-Frosch & Wright, 2006, p. 1)
“Before a disaster, minorities are more likely to be under prepared and underinsured and to be living in unsafe, substandard housing”

During a disaster, minorities and the poor are often – due to economic and language barriers – less exposed to disaster warnings, and more likely to encounter ethnic insensitivity from relief workers and government officials”

After a disaster, minorities and low-income individuals suffer slow recoveries not only because they have less insurance and incomes, but also they receive less information, fewer loans and less government relief, and encounter bias in the search for long-term housing.

(Pastor, Bullard, Boyce, Fothergill, Morello-Frosch & Wright, 2006, p. 1)
Ethical Codes and Principles

- Diversity and Cultural Competence
- Collaboration Across Disciplines
APA Ethical Code - Principle E: Respect for People's Rights and Dignity

“Psychologists respect the dignity and worth of all people, and the rights of individuals to privacy, confidentiality, and self-determination. Psychologists are aware that special safeguards may be necessary to protect the rights and welfare of persons or communities whose vulnerabilities impair autonomous decision making. Psychologists are aware of and respect cultural, individual, and role differences, including those based on age, gender, gender identity, race, ethnicity, culture, national origin, religion, sexual orientation, disability, language, and socioeconomic status and consider these factors when working with members of such groups. Psychologists try to eliminate the effect on their work of biases based on those factors, and they do not knowingly participate in or condone activities of others based upon such prejudices.”
APA Ethical Code
2.01 Boundaries of Competence

(b) Where scientific or professional knowledge in the discipline of psychology establishes that an understanding of factors associated with age, gender, gender identity, race, ethnicity, culture, national origin, religion, sexual orientation, disability, language, or socioeconomic status is essential for effective implementation of their services or research, psychologists have or obtain the training, experience, consultation, or supervision necessary to ensure the competence of their services, or they make appropriate referrals, except as provided in Standard 2.02, Providing Services in Emergencies.
APA Code of Ethics

- 3.01 Unfair Discrimination
  “In their work-related activities, psychologists do not engage in unfair discrimination based on age, gender, gender identity, race, ethnicity, culture, national origin, religion, sexual orientation, disability, socioeconomic status, or any basis proscribed by law.”

- 3.03 Other Harassment
  “Psychologists do not knowingly engage in behavior that is harassing or demeaning to persons with whom they interact in their work based on factors such as those persons' age, gender, gender identity, race, ethnicity, culture, national origin, religion, sexual orientation, disability, language, or socioeconomic status.”
APA Code of Ethics: Cooperation with Other Professionals

- Principle B: Fidelity and Responsibility

  “Psychologists consult with, refer to, or cooperate with other professionals and institutions to the extent needed to serve the best interests of those with whom they work. They are concerned about the ethical compliance of their colleagues' scientific and professional conduct.”

- Ethical Standard 3.09: Cooperation With Other Professionals

  “When indicated and professionally appropriate, psychologists cooperate with other professionals in order to serve their clients/patients effectively and appropriately.”
NASW

“Social workers are sensitive to cultural and ethnic diversity and strive to end discrimination, oppression, poverty, and other forms of social injustice. These activities may be in the form of direct practice, community organizing, supervision, consultation, administration, advocacy, social and political action, policy development and implementation, education, and research and evaluation.”

“Social workers also should be aware of the impact on ethical decision making of their clients' and their own personal values and cultural and religious beliefs and practices. They should be aware of any conflicts between personal and professional values and deal with them responsibly.”
NASW Ethical Principle: Social workers challenge social injustice.

“Social workers pursue social change, particularly with and on behalf of vulnerable and oppressed individuals and groups of people. Social workers' social change efforts are focused primarily on issues of poverty, unemployment, discrimination, and other forms of social injustice. These activities seek to promote sensitivity to and knowledge about oppression and cultural and ethnic diversity. Social workers strive to ensure access to needed information, services, and resources; equality of opportunity; and meaningful participation in decision making for all people.”
NASW 1.05 Cultural Competence and Social Diversity

(a) Social workers should understand culture and its function in human behavior and society, recognizing the strengths that exist in all cultures.

(b) Social workers should have a knowledge base of their clients' cultures and be able to demonstrate competence in the provision of services that are sensitive to clients' cultures and to differences among people and cultural groups.

(c) Social workers should obtain education about and seek to understand the nature of social diversity and oppression with respect to race, ethnicity, national origin, color, sex, sexual orientation, age, marital status, political belief, religion, and mental or physical disability.
NASW: 2.01 Respect

(a) Social workers should treat colleagues with respect and should represent accurately and fairly the qualifications, views, and obligations of colleagues.

(b) Social workers should avoid unwarranted negative criticism of colleagues in communications with clients or with other professionals.
NASW: 2.03 Interdisciplinary Collaboration

(a) Social workers who are members of an interdisciplinary team should participate in and contribute to decisions that affect the well-being of clients by drawing on the perspectives, values, and experiences of the social work profession. Professional and ethical obligations of the interdisciplinary team as a whole and of its individual members should be clearly established.

(b) Social workers for whom a team decision raises ethical concerns should attempt to resolve the disagreement through appropriate channels. If the disagreement cannot be resolved, social workers should pursue other avenues to address their concerns consistent with client well-being.
NASW: 2.04 Disputes Involving Colleagues

(a) Social workers should not take advantage of a dispute between a colleague and an employer to obtain a position or otherwise advance the social workers' own interests.

(b) Social workers should not exploit clients in disputes with colleagues or engage clients in any inappropriate discussion of conflicts between social workers and their colleagues.
Multicultural Ethical Decision Making

- **Multicultural Counseling Competencies adopted by ACA**
  (Sue, Arredondo & McDavis, 1992; Arredondo et al., 1996; later elaborated by Roysircar et al., 2003)
  - Counselor awareness of own attitudes and Beliefs
  - Client Worldview
  - Culturally Relevant Interventions
- **Recognizing our limitations**
- **Manifested in our willingness to:**
  - seek consultation
  - seek continuing education
  - make referrals
Premises of Multicultural Counseling

- All cultures represent meaningful ways of coping with the problems a particular group faces.
- All counseling can be regarded as multicultural counseling if culture is defined broadly.
- People seek counseling largely because of problems that emerge out of sociocultural conditions.
- Traditional therapy is a particular form of intervention developed in the West to cope with psychological distress.
- All cultures have developed formal or informal ways of dealing with human problems.

Das (1995)
Model of Ethical Decision Making

Ridley, Liddle, Hill & Li (2001)

- Ethically considering cultural data
- Ethically resolving cultural conflicts

Critical Reflection  Creative Problem Solving

Critical Reflection  Creative Problem Solving
Model of Ethical Decision Making: Prescriptive Version

Ridley, Liddle, Hill & Li (2001)
Addressing Ethical Issues

The agency you are working for serves clients from a wide range of ethnic communities, including a large number of Vietnamese, Cambodian, Guatemalan, Puerto Rican and Cuban immigrants. Most of the clients are low income with minimal experience with counseling yet most are suffering with symptoms reflecting clinical depression. Since Hurricanes Rita and Katrina, your agency has struggled with staffing issues. You joined the agency relatively recently but have worked in the area and with this population for quite some time. Recently, your agency has hired a number of people from outside the area to provide services. You advised management against this because the candidates had little or no experience with low income clients and had little evidence of working with clients of color.
And then…

- After a few months of working with your new colleagues, you feel that the perspective they developed in their discipline is very different from your own and you often have difficulty agreeing on the appropriate way to proceed.
Applications

What ethical issues are relevant based on your Code of Ethics?

How can you use the model from Ridley et al. to identify the complexities in this situation (feel free to be creative to elaborate on the scenario)?
Where do we go from here?

- What might you take from today and apply to your practice?
- When think to 2010, what areas of cultural competence would you like to have addressed?
Resources